

From: Chair, Board of Advisors, Naval Postgraduate School and Naval War College
To: Secretary of the Navy
Via: (1) President, Naval Postgraduate School
(2) President, Naval War College
(3) Chief of Naval Operations

Subj: MEETING OF THE BOARD OF ADVISORS (BOA) TO THE PRESIDENTS
OF THE NAVAL POSTGRADUATE SCCHOOL (NPS) AND THE NAVAL
WAR COLLEGE (NWC)

Ref: (a) Public Law 92-463, Federal Advisory Committee Act

Encl: (1) NPS/NWC BOA Meeting Minutes

1. In accordance with reference (a) the subject Board met concurrently with its two authorized Subcommittees on October 19 – 20, 2016. Enclosure (1) contains the meeting minutes.

2. Our observations and recommendations are:

a. The Naval Postgraduate School and the Naval War College are two of the finest educational institutions of their kind to be found anywhere. Both are in the hands of extraordinary teams of committed and capable leaders and staffs devoted to the mission of preparing officers of the U.S. Naval Services to participate in the design for maintaining maritime superiority. Additionally, the school and the college each put a world-class faculty on the podium. These men and women are professors and mentors of immense energy, talent, and academic reputation who are dedicated to helping Sailors and Marines, as well as students from the sister services, other branches of government, and future leaders of allied and friendly nations prepare for the complex challenges they will face in the years ahead. The school and college are the educational crown jewels of America's military institutions.

b. The school and the college are contributing to the excellence of every aspect of our military. They are focused on helping students to seek learning, to understand how to make tough decisions, and what the foundations are upon which this thinking and those difficult choices should be based. The students capitalize throughout their careers on their postgraduate and war college experiences: they help provide the edge in high velocity learning, they pitch into research and development, they employ gaming and strategy in planning and operations, they achieve new levels of leadership ability and ethical behavior. We believe that the return on the Department of the Navy's investment in people, in Marines and Sailors, is enormous and is apparent every day and everywhere that America's "away team" engages.

c. The Board of Advisors encourages the Secretary of the Navy and members of the new Navy Department secretariat to visit both institutions at their earliest opportunity. The chair of the Board of Advisors to the Presidents of the Naval Postgraduate School and the Naval War College is available to call on the Secretary of the Navy, the Under Secretary, the Assistant Secretary (M&RA) and any other members of the Secretariat at their convenience. The chair of the Naval Postgraduate School sub-committee and the chair of the Naval War College sub-committee are also.

3. The next meeting of this board will be held October 18 – 19, 2017 in Arlington, VA. The next meeting for the NWC BOA Subcommittee will convene on April 6 – 7, 2017 in Newport, RI. The NPS BOA Subcommittee will meet in Monterey, CA on April 26 – 27, 2017.

Very respectfully,



LEE F. GUNN

Copy to:

Commandant, Marine Corps

SECNAV ASN M&RA

SECNAV ASN MP&P

Vice Chief of Naval Operations

OPNAV N1/N4/N8

DNS – 32

DON/AA

Library of Congress, Exchange and Gift Division (8 copies)

NPS/NWC BOA Members

MEETING MINUTES FROM BOARD OF ADVISORS, NAVAL POSTGRADUATE SCHOOL AND NAVAL WAR COLLEGE ON 19 – 20 OCTOBER 2016

Member Attendees:

VADM (Ret) Lee Gunn (Parent Committee Chair)
VADM (Ret) David Frost (NPS Subcommittee Chair)
The Honorable Christopher Jehn, (NWC Subcommittee Chair)
Mr. Walter Anderson (NPS Subcommittee)
Dr. Robert Fossum (NPS Subcommittee)
The Honorable Kim Wincup (NPS Subcommittee)
VADM Robert Burke, USN (Parent Committee and NPS and NWC Subcommittees)
Mr. Dave Menzen/Ms. Elizabeth Gracia (Representing CNP)
Dr. James Anderson (Representing USMC TECOM)
Dr. Todd Stewart (Representing President, Air University)
CAPT Gary Powe, USN (Representing Chief of Naval Research)
Dr. GK Cunningham (Representing Commandant, Army War College)
Ambassador (Ret) Dr. Nancy Soderberg (Parent Committee and NWC Subcommittee)
Ambassador (Ret) Dr. Reuben Brigety, II (NWC Subcommittee)
Dr. Gordon Adams (Parent Committee)

Others in Attendance:

Dr. Lewis Duncan, NWC Provost
Dr. Phil Haun, NWC Dean of Academics
RADM (ret.) James Kelly, NWC Dean, College of Operational and Strategic Leadership
Prof Tom Culora, NWC Dean, Center for Naval Warfare Studies (CNWS)
VADM (Ret) Ron Route, NPS President
Dr. Steve Lerman, NPS Provost
LT Kelly Blake, USN, NPS Staff
Ms. Christine Kays, NPS Staff
Ms. Jaye Panza, Designated Federal Officer (DFO)
Dr. Thomas Gibbons, Alternate DFO

Honored Guests:

The Honorable Franklin Parker, Assistant Secretary of Navy (M&RA)
Admiral Bill Moran, USN, Vice Chief of Naval Operations

Call to Order

The Meeting was called to order at 8:30am by the DFO on Thursday, October 20, 2016.

DFO gave a brief on the Board membership, how the process works for nominating new board members.

Mr. Menzen explained the role of the Nominations Review Panel and how it comes up with prospective candidates. It was noted that there is a need for more board members with engineering experience. More STEM representation is especially desired on the NPS Board. People who understand STEM issues. Board members have agreed to provide some names of candidates if desired. Board members also expressed some concerns with the length of time it takes for their annual renewals. Board members are only able to function if their appointments are approved in a timely manner.

To reflect the value the Navy places on NPS and NWC fully, the BoA believes the Navy needs to take the following steps to ensure these institutions remain strong and fulfill the important missions the Department of the Navy has assigned them:

Noting particularly that the schools compete with operational requirements and assignments for high quality students. The schools compete also for resources against those same operational requirements. The sense of the BoA is that the Navy needs to be especially sensitive to that competition and do everything possible to ensure that both institutions are equipped and populated to perform their missions.

Specifically, the Navy should reinstate (and properly define the meaning of) the concept of Flagship Institution status. This important issue is, for instance, directly tied to accreditation and is relevant for maintenance and modernization of labs.

The BoA understands that work is underway to relax DoD restrictions on conference travel, copyrights, and outside employment of faculty and staff; still the BoA emphasizes that the schools must be able to support professional growth and development of their people in order to remain competitive in the marketplace of ideas and recruitment and retention of their dedicated and talented people. This too, like the condition of labs and the physical plants of the schools directly relates to accreditation.

VCNO and CNP/N1 visit:

Admiral Moran themes:

Thanked the board members for their service. Addressed budget challenges. Need for a bigger Navy; world demands are off the charts. Busier now than ever, even at the end of 15 years of combat. Doing what we can to support challenges and Navy. Country is getting great value for our money from NPS/NWC. Everything we do is more and more expensive. Money is tight, systems we are buying are more expensive, people are more expensive, and moving people around is more expensive, making it harder and harder to do what we want to do. Trying to determine what we can do in light of changing administration, once again starting new FY under another continuing resolution. Navy needs to value education more and more than it does. FY17 budget reaffirms, buttresses what we have. The Navy places emphasis on graduate education. Message from CNO is he is fully committed to making NPS and NWC world class flagship institutions. From the physical plant, classroom environment and quality of instructors; to the number of opportunities beyond NPS. TYCOM leadership headed in the right direction valuing graduate education.

NPS doing a great job getting on a sustainable path over the last few years. Fiscal challenges providing full auditability across DoD. CNO supports High Velocity Learning (HVL) and feels it's obvious where NPS/NWC fit in. A lot going on with HVL with how to implement, how to inculcate it with partners across the industry and in the fleet.

Ambassador Brigety asked about diversity, specifically how is the CNO thinking about diversity as it relates to career progression, tracking career path, providing opportunities for promotion at the Flag level?

CNP focus is on *different* as well as *diverse*. Looking at mentorship opportunities for minority sailors. Challenge is getting enough individuals to move in that direction. The Navy's approach is purposely, not affirmatively. From recruiting to career management, trying to provide the right opportunities for the skill sets. Navy giving it a robust effort. Good naval leaders are thinking about inclusion from a diverse perspective.

VCNO indicated that "Flagship" status not documented anywhere within the Navy, it's an *understanding* that the institutions are maintained at a level higher with support for facilities and laboratories.

Vice Admiral Burke (CNP) spoke about "Sailor 2025" and ready relevant learning, inclusion and diversity. One focus is on life/work balance for sailors. Strengthening the quality of work, quality of life, health and wellness for sailors. Mid-level in career focus is on engineering and technical; senior level career focus on strategy and political science. NPS is for mid-level officers; NWC at the senior-level strategy high level. He asked if this was still a good model. Still an adequate investment? This will be discussed at next 4-star conference. Need to start to develop strategists early. Find the right mix.

Chairman Gunn received and discussed the minutes (below) from the two Sub-committees and asked if there were any additional comments from them or public. There being none, the DFO adjourned the meeting at 12noon.

*MEETING MINUTES FROM BOARD OF ADVISORS, NAVAL
POSTGRADUATE SCHOOL (NPS) SUB-COMMITTEE MEETING ON
19 OCTOBER 2016*

The meeting was called to order by the DFO at 8:30am. VADM (Ret) David Frost (Chair) welcomed all in attendance. The members respectfully acknowledged their colleague, Dr. Jack R. Borsting who passed away two months ago. Jack was eulogized in the extended comments of several members. We all were very fortunate for having known him and we expressed our profound gratitude for his service and his contributions over these many years.

NPS President's Update

After the tribute given in memory of Dr. Borsting, President Route introduced Dr. Steve Lerman, the new NPS Provost. Other leadership changes included the hiring of a new Director of Business Operations, Mr. Les Martin, a retired US Navy Supply Corps Captain. The board members will meet Mr. Martin at their next meeting in April 2017 in Monterey. Mr. Martin is responsible for day-to-day management of the Comptroller and Contracting Office. The Comptroller and Contracting Officer still maintain direct access to the President as required by statute.

President Route offered his update in two segments—"Looking Back" at NPS Events and Accomplishments in FY16; and "Looking Forward" to the Challenges and Focus for FY17.

Looking Back:

The FY16 IG Inspection (board members were provided a copy of the inspection report and it was also sent to them via email). To summarize, the NAVINSGEN stated the "The NPS of 2016 is no longer the NPS of 2012". The findings included: the NPS Financial Management is rigorous and sound; legal counsel and staff are included in planning; local IG functions are highly effective and well synchronized with the Managers Internal Control Program (MICP); the NPS Foundation and the NPS Gift Fund program is operating in full compliance. Past culture of resistance to fiscal controls has been replaced by a culture of total compliance.

President Route and Provost Lerman provided an update on the NPS Work Acceptance Process (WAP). Working with OPNAV, the WAP facilitates a compliance requirement by which NPS takes in proposals from various organizations to determine whether or not to accept the proposed work. While keeping within the 51% rule, NPS may determine to accept any proposed work that falls within its core mission. Mr. Menzen (OPNAV N12) noted that the school is doing a good job with this WAP process. The Board agreed it is a good process and is glad to see the issue resolved.

Mr. Menzen confirmed that President Route has the "green light" to begin hiring to the new FTE number of 1047 in order to balance the workforce. NPS will no longer be required to send hiring waivers to N1. In order to hire to these controls, NPS needs to have the work to support the FTE. Where applicable, the work will require Memoranda of Agreement and

reimbursable funding documents in order to hire to those controls. There are presently over 100 hiring actions in process. Many are administrative positions to support academic areas and faculty. There was discussion of the WAP in relationship to the new FTE controls.

NPS can start rebuilding and strengthening its capabilities in two understaffed areas by filling the most significant positions in the administrative structure area and in faculty/academic support.

Looking Forward:

NPS strategic thinking and planning is focused on four strategic goals:

1. Transform NPS students through excellent education programs consisting of relevant and innovative instruction and research experiences.
2. Build and maintain excellence in instruction and research in faculty, and professional development for our educators.
3. Leverage the opportunities created by sponsored activities to benefit the education of naval students.
4. Relentlessly pursue organizational effectiveness and efficiency, such as how NPS provides support to its academic departments; interfacing with sister services; and effective management of the .edu domain.

Faculty Issues: The Board discussed the ability of the Navy and the school to maintain a high quality faculty with President Route and his staff. Many factors bear on this important issue including a difficult period of reductions and attrition, frustrations with the travel approval process, the inability to offer competitive salaries, and recent limitations in administrative support. These issues will be matters of ongoing concern but are receiving full management attention. The Board continues to be concerned about faculty morale and intends to continue its review of the issue at the April meeting in Monterey.

The non-DOD conference attendance approval process still needs improvement. NPS leaders are doing everything they can internally to streamline faculty conference attendance. This is an important issue to the faculty in an institution of higher education. The Navy's approval process is not fully adapted to the unique needs of the NPS faculty. The Board intends to inquire further into potential solutions.

Discussion continued on a number of relevant topics including:

- Reinforcement of NPS Academic Research Programs
- General Naval Education Programs
- The target audience for NPS education. The Vice Chief of Naval Operations reinforced the concept that NPS also educates joint and allied officers.
- The list of notable NPS graduates (list provided to board members via email on Oct 26, 2016)
- The methods for communicating the needs for research and advanced study into naval mission needs by Navy organizations to NPS... and the methods for communication of results back to the Navy.
- Filling quotas, payback tour policies, and related management issues.

- NPS Hot Future Program Areas:
 - High Velocity Learning
 - Modeling & Simulation
 - Cyber readiness
 - Wargaming and Innovation
 - Unmanned Systems

VADM (Ret) Frost asked if there were any other comments or remarks from the Committee or the public. There being none, he thanked the attendees and the meeting was adjourned at 12 noon.

*MEETING MINUTES FROM BOARD OF ADVISORS, NAVAL WAR
COLLEGE (NWC) SUB-COMMITTEE MEETING ON 19 OCTOBER 2016*

The DFO convened the meeting at 1:00pm. The Honorable Christopher Jehn (Chair) welcomed all in attendance.

Provost

Dr. Lewis Duncan addressed the designation of the Naval War College Foundation as a “prohibited source” under the law and how, to many, this is a deleteriously negative connotation. For each of our institutions, these foundations are formed for the purpose of providing support to their associated schools. Their members provide needed financial support throughout the year. Dr. Duncan highlighted that NWC is interested in pursuing legislation to relieve foundations from this language by designating them as an *excepted* source, and that this is perhaps best addressed for both NWC and NPS through the AERB.

Dr. Duncan also provided an update on Faculty Normalization. The Naval War College competes with civilian institutions to attract and retain the best faculty members available. Current policies make it difficult to accomplish that. These include policies on copyrights, faculty conference travel, outside employment versus conflict of interest, and time accounting policies that treat faculty as hourly workers. Faculty members are professional educators and should be treated with the trust and respect appropriate to their professional service. Many of these policies can be addressed broadly through the Military Education Coordination Council (MECC) and the Advanced Education Review Board (AERB) and are being worked. Unfortunately, these policies are having growing impact on NWC’s ability to attract and retain civilian faculty members. NWC is also advancing legislative language changes specific to the Naval War College and the Marine Corps University (by virtue of sharing the same authorizing legislation).

Mr. Menzen mentioned that Faculty Normalization would be an agenda item at the upcoming AERB with the VCNO.

Dr. Duncan provided information about the NWC Resources Committee and explained how the deans each prioritize their positions and needs, and following discussion then vote on allocation of discretionary resources across the College.

Dean, CNWS

Dean Tom Culora discussed CNWS research priorities for FY 2017-2018. For the research, analysis, and gaming function, the Dean of CNWS directs the development of concepts concerning national security and strategic thought, and of ideas for the current and future employment of joint and naval forces in peace and war. His duties include coordinating all advanced research activities at the College. The CNWS research priorities for FY 2017-2018 include the following:

- Geographical – China (South and East China Sea, Taiwan, Silk Road and Belt), Russia (All Theaters), Iran, Indian Ocean, and Korean Peninsula
- Functional – Operational and Tactical Warfighting, Joint and Coalition Warfare, National Maritime Strategy, Information Warfare (Cyber and Space), War Gaming Community of Practice, International Law, Deterrence (Nuclear and Conventional), Gray Zone Conflict, War Escalation and Termination, and Maritime History.

Dr. Brigety questioned why other areas of the world, i.e. Africa or Europe, were not listed as geographical priorities. Dean Culora answered that he only has a fixed amount of resources. However, there are faculty members and students at NWC who study these areas and there are electives offered that focus on them.

Dean Culora also addressed the new Russia Maritime Studies Institute (RMSI). The RMSI was established on August 31, 2016 in response to the changing security environment and based on interest from CNO and other senior flag officers. RMSI's mission is to conduct unclassified research into Russian maritime issues on behalf of the U.S. Navy and our NATO partners. Resources for RMSI are currently modest. Developing a plan to grow the institute will be based on the needs of the Navy and the Fleet. NWC is currently adjusting internal resources to meet this demand. NWC will POM for other resources as RMSI matures. There will be a small number of students involved in student level research to complement the work.

Additionally, Dean Culora highlighted the Wargaming Virtual Community of Practice. The SECNAV Memorandum on Wargaming dated 5 May 2015 did several things. Among them, it mandated establishment of “a virtual community of practice for Sailors, Marines, and Civilians with interest in wargaming to further develop and expand this competency across the DON.” The CNO identified the NWC's War Gaming Department (WGD) as the appropriate entity to organize and house the VCoP. The Naval War gaming VCoP will:

- Conduct periodic meetings and conferences;
- Focus on application of wargaming methodology and avoidance of war-gaming pathologies;
- Extend availability of professional war gamer expertise through an on-line environment;
- Conduct training classes at NWC and virtually;
- Become the vehicle and venue for potential Online and Virtual Gaming;
- Act as the single repository for Naval War College game reports but also build and maintain the database and reference portal for other warfighting research that contributes to, and is related to, wargame content.

The VCoP site content is currently under development. The goal is to make the site inclusive, informative, and useful.

Dean of Academics

Dean Phil Haun provided an update on the initiative to bestow a master's degree upon selected international officers upon graduation from NWC. International officers attending the NCC and NSC resident programs currently do not receive a master's degree like their colleagues in the College of Naval Warfare and College of Naval Command and Staff. There is concern that the Naval War College is losing talented international officers to other professional military education schools. As with the United States, other nations value graduate education for their future senior officers.

Approximately 25% of international officers attending the College already enroll in master's degree programs at civilian schools such as Salve Regina University. This additional coursework takes time away from the students' studies at the College. The additional costs of these programs are borne by the students or their nations.

A faculty committee is developing appropriate acceptance criteria for the international master's degree.

Dean, International Programs

Dean Tom Mangold was not able to attend this subcommittee meeting. In his place, Dean Tom Culora provided a brief update on the recent International Seapower Symposium (ISS).

The CNO hosted the 22nd ISS at the US Naval War College during the period 20-23 September 2016. 105 different countries (including the United States) were represented by 197 delegates and their spouses. 45 (23%) of the delegates were NWC alumni. The theme of the ISS this year was "Stronger Maritime Partners." The CNO, SECNAV, and DEPSECDEF all provided remarks during the ISS.

NWC staff and faculty provided critical support in the planning and execution of the symposium.

The ISS occurs every other year. It can be difficult for NWC to receive funding because the ISS is not an annual event. Dr. Duncan mentioned that NWC is pursuing an annual funding allocation to stabilize the ISS funding.

Dean, College of Operational and Strategic Leadership (COSL)

Dean James Kelly discussed each of the elements of his organization and what they do. This includes: the faculty at the Maritime Staff Operators Course (MSOC), the Maritime Operational Planners Course (MOPC), the Executive Level of War Course (ELOC), the Joint Force Maritime Component Commander Course (JFMCC), and Combined Force Maritime Component Commander Course (CFMCC). Dean Kelly also spoke about the Assess and Assist Team (AAT) and their role in helping the fleet.

Dean Kelly then described the Leadership and Ethics team and what they are doing. NWC remains responsible to CNO for curriculum oversight on leadership and ethical development across the Navy. Working with CNO ADM John Richardson, we are in an iterative process of developing a Leader Development Framework which will put the Navy Leader Development Strategy (signed by former CNO ADM Jonathan Greenert) into action. This is closely linked to the GOLD Level of Effort (“Strengthen Our Navy Team for the Future”) in “The Design for Maintaining Maritime Superiority” (DMMS) which recognizes the important role leadership plays. Additionally, NWC now has the lead for the GREEN Level of Effort (“High Velocity Learning”) which recognizes a need to ensure the culture of the Navy is fertile for planting the seeds to accelerate institutional learning in order to outpace any competitor. This all requires leadership involvement and consequently leader development is critical to enabling the vision expressed by DMMS.

In this effort, we continue to work across all Navy communities with the Leader Development Continuum Council (LDCC) to align and synchronize the various efforts. The role of the LDCC may also be evolving to include the many Sailor 2025 initiatives to ensure alignment, reduce redundancy, and add re-enforcement where necessary. Flag level representatives are on the LDCC from each of the Navy communities.

Discussion

Initially, the discussion focused on how to get the best US Navy officers to NWC as Navy students. There is a perception that other Services send their best and brightest officers to the NWC while the Navy does not. Dean Haun disagreed and expressed that the US Navy officers in the CNC&S class are extremely talented and among the best in the Navy. However, there is room for improvement in the quality of US Navy officers in the CNW class.

Mr. Jehn asked on what issues or problems could the BOA realistically help the institution.

Dr. Duncan highlighted Faculty Normalization and Prohibited Source legislation and then asked the Deans for input.

Dean Haun pointed out that the SECNAV Fellows Program at NWC has been discontinued in recent years. He pointed out that this program could have value for the US Navy, the individual, and the NWC overall and that he would support starting it again.

Dean Haun also mentioned that the Fleet Seminar Program on Capitol Hill allows military officers and Congressional aides to get the NWC education. There is a waiting list for Congressional aides that funding for additional seminars would alleviate.

Dean Culora requested support to keep the civilian faculty salaries competitive with civilian universities. The faculty is one of the strengths of the institution and it’s important that faculty salaries remain competitive to retain current faculty and hire new faculty members.

Mr. Jehn asked if there were any other comments or remarks from the Committee or the public. There being none, he thanked the Committee and the NWC representatives.

The DFO adjourned the meeting at 5:30pm.

All above meeting minutes certified by:

Lee F. Gunn
David E. Frost
Christopher Jehn